



EPISCOPAL CHURCHPEOPLE for a FREE SOUTHERN AFRICA

339 Lafayette Street, New York, N.Y. 10012-2725

(212) 477-0066

FAX: (212) 979-1013

founded 12 June 1956

#175

30 August 1996

ANC admits abuses but 'fought just war'

MARY BRAID
Cape Town

The African National Congress yesterday made its fullest confession of human rights violations but argued that there was no moral equivalency between its acts of violence and those of the apartheid government.

Thabo Mbeki, the country's president-in-waiting, presented the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC), the body which was created to heal the nation by laying bare the abuses of the apartheid years, with a 100-page report which included a list of 34 members who were executed by the ANC in Angolan training camps and an admission that some cadres were killed after being falsely accused of spying.

After Mr Mbeki's three-hour testimony, Archbishop Desmond Tutu, the Commission's chairman, congratulated the ANC on being the first party to use the word "sorry". The ANC's evidence came the day after FW de Klerk, the former president and leader of the Nationalist Party (NP), offered a qualified apology to the nation for apartheid and past mistakes.

The NP submission was short on detail. Mr de Klerk denied all knowledge of state-backed hit squads, and preferred to focus on the "terrorist" bombings and attacks carried out by the ANC.

Yesterday Mr Mbeki said that the commission's investigation into human rights abuses must take into account that apartheid was "one of the most odious and vicious political systems of the 20th century"; a system judged by the United Nations to be a crime against humanity.

"The overwhelming majority of actions carried out in the

course of the just war of national liberation do not constitute 'gross violations of human rights' as defined by the act establishing and mandating the TRC," he said. Even "necklacing", he said, had to be seen against the background of institutionalised state violence.

The ANC had adopted the armed struggle only after decades of futile peaceful lobbying. It was "a last, rather than first, resort", he said. The organisation had always resisted



Mbeki: Armed struggle was a 'last, rather than first, resort'

internal pressure to target "soft" civilian targets.

Mr Mbeki's bid for recognition of the ANC's moral high ground flies in the face of the act which established the commission, and which was the cornerstone of the deal brokered by the NP and the ANC to end white minority rule.

Dr Alex Boraine, deputy chairman of the commission said that the act made no distinction between the violence from either side. He and other commissioners had no choice but to suppress their sympathy with Mr Mbeki's point of view.

"Of course there is a world of difference between the violence of the oppressor and the oppressed," said Dr Boraine. "The Dutch resistance fighters to Nazi occupation knifed and killed but they were heroes against an abhorrent system. The fact is this commission is not about justice. It is about truth and reconciliation and national healing. Any other approach would have split this country in half."

He said the commission could only be understood against the background of a negotiated settlement. "If the struggle had been won on the battlefield there would have been a victor and vanquished and the victor would have dictated terms."

Dr Boraine said that in spite of yesterday's testimony Mr Mbeki understood that vacating the moral high ground was the price the ANC had paid for the peaceful transition of power.

Yesterday the ANC said it accepted "collective responsibility" for the violence it had orchestrated. This contrasted sharply with Mr de Klerk's refusal to take responsibility for murders carried out by the security forces although he admitted the NP had created the conditions which allowed them to take place.

While its view that ANC violence had no special legitimacy may go unchallenged, the NP can expect some tough questioning on the limits of responsibility when the political parties return to the commission later this year. Yesterday Mr Boraine warned that he could not accept Mr de Klerk's distinction between the government and its functionaries. "They were as one," he said.

Priest testifies on bombing

By JOHN YELD

When the anguished memories become too painful and tears well uncontrollably in their eyes, many survivors testifying to the Truth and Reconciliation Commission reach for the box of tissues placed thoughtfully on the table in front of them.

But what do you do if you have a set of bright stainless-steel claws instead of hands - hands blown off in a horror letter-bomb attack that also left you blind in one eye?

Other disfigured victims and survivors have already testified to the commission's human rights violations committee during its first half-dozen public hearings, and more will surely follow in the months to come.

But none has brought home more forcefully the appalling legacy of violence that engulfed South Africa in recent decades than maimed Anglican priest Michael Lapsley during his testimony in Kimberley this week.

Highly articulate and outwardly calm, the New Zealand-born priest recalled the broad events of his life to the point where the letter bomb - concealed in a religious magazine - exploded in his hands as he opened his post.

But when he recalled how it had been the overwhelming support of his family, both personal and religious, that had enabled

him to survive those bleak, painful weeks after the attack, Father Lapsley came to a halt, temporarily choked by emotion.

During his testimony, Lapsley described in graphic detail the terrible ordeal that followed the bomb blast in Harare in April 1990. Ordained in Australia, he became a member of the Anglican religious order, the Society of the Sacred Mission. After being sent by the order to study at the University of Natal in 1973, he became national chaplain for Anglican students in 1976.

"Although I was aware of the evils of apartheid and was part of anti-racist activity in Australia, I was a convinced pacifist when I came to South Africa," he said.

"I soon discovered, however, that it is not possible to be neutral. I ministered to students from all backgrounds and realised that if you were white and did nothing to change the situation, you in fact became a functionary of apartheid.

"I was not involved in any political organisation but regarded myself as part of the struggle against apartheid."

Because of his particular theological leanings and teachings, Lapsley incurred the wrath of the South African authorities and was served with a deportation order.

He went to Lesotho, where he trained priests for the Anglican diocese there. "I joined the ANC

soon after coming to Lesotho and for some time headed the ANC unit at the University of Lesotho, where my involvement concerned education, pastoral and theological matters.

"When I applied for membership of the ANC, it symbolically represented taking citizenship of a South Africa which we were still fighting for."

During 1979 and 1980 he was "demonised" by articles in The Citizen newspaper and the right-wing Aida Parker Newsletter, Lapsley said. In December 1982 he was visiting his family in New Zealand and fortuitously escaped the SADF raid on Maseru in which a number of citizens died.

"On my return to Lesotho, the church authorities argued that I had probably been a target of the attack and expressed fear that if I remained in Lesotho, there could be further SADF raids and attacks. I was therefore effectively compelled to leave Lesotho for this reason."

In 1983 Lapsley settled in Harare, where he remained until the explosion in 1990. "I remained conscious throughout and experienced excruciating pain. Friends took me to hospital."

After treatment at a private clinic he was transferred to Harare's main hospital, where he underwent operations throughout the night. After about a month in Harare he was flown to Aus-



SURVIVOR: Michael Lapsley testifying in Kimberley last week. "I regarded myself as part of the struggle against apartheid"

tralia and spent another three months recuperating at the Prince of Wales Hospital in Sydney.

During November 1990, approximately seven months after the attack, he returned to Harare. After being granted indemnity, he visited South Africa for six weeks during the middle of the following year and moved permanently to this country in February 1992.

Since February 1993 he has been chaplain to the Trauma Centre for Victims of Violence and Torture in Woodstock. Lapsley told the commission he regarded himself as a "victim over apartheid" and not simply as a victim or - the preferred word for many people - a survivor.

"It is part of my victory to have been able to return to South Africa and to live my life as fully and as joyfully as possible. The grace of God and the help of people of faith and goodwill has enabled me not to become a prisoner of hatred but rather to grow in my faith, compassion and commitment to justice."

When he had completed his testimony, commission chairman Archbishop Desmond Tutu said: "He has been an icon ... a living example of the kind of thing we're trying to help be incarnated in our country. I'm very deeply humbled and proud that Michael is now a priest in my diocese, and a priest of whom I'm deeply proud."

AFFIDAVIT

I, the undersigned Samuel Solomon Pholotho residing at 1179 Mapetla Village in Soweto do hereby make oath and say:

I was detained in the early hours of Monday the 5th May, 1969 under the Terrorism Act

At the time of the detention aforesaid, I was banned and restricted under the Suppression of Communism Act 44 of 1950 on the 31/5/65. My trade union activities and employment with the Transvaal Metal Workers Union were ended. I was forced to turn to hawking soft goods to take care of my wife and 3 minor children born in 1952, 1958 and 1961.

Details of Torture:

- a) No human contact only your interrogators;
- b) Your isolation increased in a windowless cell.
- c) Held for 4 days and nights without food & water.
- d) Made to stand on uneven bricks intended for you to fall.
- e) Fell and hurt myself- found myself dripping in cold water. They had attempted to revive me.
- f) I had not sat down for the 4 days/nights.
- g) I was handcuffed to the rafters. Endless pain.
- h) Punched on both sides of my ribs by the police officers.
- D) I was held in isolation from Monday 7.45am to Thursday 5.30pm.
- j) My feet were so swollen I could not keep my shoes on.
- h) My anxiety about my family was endless torture.

'Kleenex' truth inquiry starts big clean-up

Two major developments should dramatically alter the way the truth commission works, reports

Eddie Koch

THE truth commission's announcement this week that it will subpoena suspects in some of the most prominent political atrocities of the apartheid era comes on the eve of two other major developments that could dramatically alter the way the body has operated.

The truth process has so far been dominated by public hearings of the human rights violations committee — causing some right-wing circles to parody it as the Kleenex commission — while the body's amnesty hearings and judgments, which involve more complex and legalistic procedures, have lagged behind.

So far 1.750 people have applied for amnesty from the commission. But the vast majority of these are people already convicted and serving sentences for their crimes — the commission's records show that only 95 non-prisoners have so far offered to tell all in return for immunity from prosecution.

Next week political parties will present public accounts of why their members engaged in human rights abuse during the apartheid period. The amnesty committee has announced its first judgment is imminent.

Official participation by political parties in the truth process next week could open the way for co-operation by perpetrators who belong to some of the right-wing groups which have a tradition of following the example set by their leadership.

The major political parties drew lots to determine the order in which they will make



Alex Boraine: Getting tough with those who refuse to offer evidence PHOTO: HENNER FRANKENFELD

their submissions to the commission. The political party submissions have been kept under tight wraps and have not even been sent to the commission in advance, in case they are leaked to the media.

First off will be the Freedom Front on Monday, followed by the African Christian Democratic Party. The Pan Africanist Congress appears on Tuesday, while the National Party will talk on Wednesday. The African National Congress will deliver its presentation on Thursday.

The *Mail & Guardian* has established that the NP's account of the 1980s is some 25 pages long and deals with a broad set of strategies adopted to deal with what its members perceived to be the "total onslaught". The ANC's document is "voluminous" and deals quite frankly with abuses that were carried out by its members in the notorious detention centres.

However, thousands of agents who committed political murder and human rights abuses in those turbulent years will be much more interested in the first judgment of the truth commission's amnesty committee.

This will be a test of how the committee will interpret its powers to grant immunity in exchange for full confessions about past misdeeds. It will provide crucial guidelines for perpetrators who are still weighing up whether it is worth their while to apply for amnesty.

The truth commission legislation states that the Norgaard Principles should be used to decide whether a perpetrator be granted immunity from prosecution for crimes com-

mitted because of political motivation. Most importantly, these state that the "proportionality" principle — that crimes can only be forgiven if they were carried out in proportion to the political ideal that was being fought for at the time — be used to decide if perpetrators should be granted amnesty.

Truth commission spokesman John Allen said the body was not seriously concerned about media coverage that depicted it as a toothless body unable to force "dirty tricks" agents into coming clean about their role in maintaining white domination.

"It would be natural for perpetrators to wait for the amnesty committee to indicate how it will apply the Norgaard Principles before making a decision about whether they should submit applications," he said.

He noted the deadline for making amnesty applications is December 15 and the commission expected a flood of requests from perpetrators who are currently adopting a wait-and-see approach towards the end of the year.

Commission vice-chairman Alex Boraine announced this week that suspected perpetrators of past political crimes will be issued with subpoenas to appear before the truth body if they refuse to offer evidence voluntarily.

The new get-tough approach will form part of a strategy that involves a series of probes by the commission's investigative unit into some of the worst atrocities committed during the apartheid era.

Cape journos work in fear

Journalists covering Pagad's campaign against gangsters have found themselves staring down the barrels of guns, reports Jacquie Golding-Duffy

JOURNALISTS are once again being targeted, as the war in the Cape Flats continues between the Muslim community group, People against Gangsterism and Drugs (Pagad) and gangs.

In the 12 days following the shooting and torching of Hard Livings gangster leader, Rashaad Staggie, one reporter and four photographers have been injured.

A reporter from *Die Burger* in Cape Town suffered a gunshot wound in his arm and the newspaper's photographer suffered shrapnel wounds to his lower leg. The other two photographers are freelancers and details of their injuries are unknown.

Several journalists, photographers and cameramen claim to have been openly threatened at a press conference hosted by Pagad. Some Muslim journalists have also allegedly received anonymous phone calls from people who purport to be Pagad members, warning them about stories they have written or are planning to write.

Says one South African Broadcasting Corporation journalist, who refused to be named for fear of her life: "I believe they will do it. Pagad will not hesitate in shooting us. We were openly told at a Pagad press conference that if we didn't do stories which were favourable and sympathetic towards their cause, then we better watch out. We were told that we will be regarded as part of the criminals and will be targeted."

Another SABC cameraman had a gun held to his head, but refused to speak to the *Mail & Guardian*. His colleague says she finds it "disturbing" that neither the government or any press unions have spoken out against the groups targeting journalists.

"For days the media have been under death threat and no one, but no one has come out against this"

"For days the media have been under death threat and no one, but no one has come out against this."

South African Union of Journalists (SAUJ) national organiser Dudley Moko says the union was not informed of the death threats against journalists and has, therefore, made no statement. However, the SAUJ is planning to make a statement about the injuries



Targeted: Photographers, who caught on film the murder of Staggie, have allegedly been threatened by members of Pagad PHOTOGRAPH: BENNY GOOL

suffered by journalists, he says.

Reuters television senior producer and cameraman Jimi Matthews says the threats to journalists' lives are "disturbing, but not unexpected."

"It is common that at scenes of conflict journalists become targets, especially when rival groups are frustrated. What is definitely scary is the open threats of violence against reporters, photographers and cameramen who are out there with no motive other than to do their jobs. It is disconcerting when guns are being waved at one in an effort to intimidate all reporters," says Matthews

He says there exists a misconception of the role and function of the media by the general public. "People often want to dictate to journalists what they must write. People forget that journalists only report what they see and are not commissioned to do a story because it allows them to take sides. Journalists aim at writing balanced

reports, while photographers and cameramen get the picture or footage required."

Matthews says it's harder for photographers and cameramen to blend in with the crowd as cameras are "very visible". He says rumours, implicating

photographers and cameramen with last week's assassination of taxi driver Faizel Ryklief, are circulating.

According to Matthews, there are allegations that Ryklief's assassination followed his identification from video footage and/or photographs.

Ryklief, allegedly a Pagad member, is believed to have been the target of a revenge attack by the gangsters, fol-

lowing the lynching of Staggie.

"It is a popular perception and an easy way out to put the blame on cameramen. We are then told by Pagad not to sell our photographs and video material to the gangsters. This is insulting to journalists who will never implicate themselves in such a ludicrous manner," Matthews says.

He claims that cameramen and photographers are the focus of Pagad's attention as there is a misconception that the cameramen and photographers are either assisting the gangsters and/or the police.

Matthews's claims have been supported by several journalists the *Mail & Guardian* approached.

One reporter from a foreign news agency says reporters, photographers and cameramen have all come under enormous pressure, but admits there is a "misunderstanding" that the death of Ryklief was as a result of an identification from photographs and video footage.

"Photographers and cameramen seem to have the blame laid at their feet as people assume it is solely owing to their material that Ryklief was killed."

There have been allegations by a reporter that during his interview with the brother of the assassinated Hard Livings gang leader, Rashied Staggie, he saw him rummaging through photographs which presumably were smuggled out of the Argus library.

"It was scary because there he was flipping through photographs which were stamped: Argus Company. It is difficult to say how he got the photographs, but anyone could have smuggled the photographs out," he said.

Chairman of the Freedom of Expression Institute, Raymond Louw, says he

hopes journalists and photographers "will not bow to the demands of militants", but "will uphold the traditions of their craft and continue to report in an accurate and balanced manner."

"Hopefully the community will respect journalists as observers doing their professional jobs."

Louw says it is entirely up to reporters to decide whether they are going to cover a particular story and endanger their lives.

However, he says, it is "easy to pontificate from an armchair", while reporters and photographers are out on the frontline.

"I respect their bravery out on the frontline as they perform their duty by getting the story to the general public."

Cape Times photographer Benny Gool, whose photographs of the torching of the Staggie twin were splashed across the front pages of several national newspapers, is keeping a low profile. He refused to speak to the *M&G* for fear of his life and that of his family.

There are claims, however, that the National Intelligence Agency (NIA) has informed Gool that a price has been put on his head, but it is unclear whether it is the Hard Livings gangsters or Pagad members who want to assassinate him.

The *Cape Times* reporter who covered the story alongside Gool has apparently been pulled off the story by the newspaper's editor.

Cape Times editor Moegsien Williams could not be reached for comment at the time of going to press.

Some journalists claim that their colleagues often resort to sensationalism by misconstruing the community's efforts. Says one journalist: "It is not only the Muslims that are fighting the drug lords, but there are several Christians and people of different religious persuasions that support what Pagad is doing. It is sometimes unfortunate that when Muslims stand up, they are seen as Islamic fundamentalists."

Earlier this week, Pagad threatened to call in the support of two militant Middle Eastern organisations — the Iranian-backed Hezbollah and the Palestinian Hamas organisations.

The support of the organisations would be sought unless the government and the police rid the Cape Flats of gangsters and drug barons, said the organisation's leader, Muhammed Ali "Phantom" Parker.

Many journalists admit to being scared, with some deciding to forfeit a good story and get out while they are still ahead. Others have decided to hang in, because they feel they have to see the story through to the end. But none of the journalists, photographers or cameramen have expressed a gung-ho attitude; instead they are just attempting to do their jobs.

Call for a doctors' truth commission

MAIL & GUARDIAN
August 2 to 8 1996

Doctors, heal your profession, is the call as pressure mounts on the medical profession to hold its own truth commission. **Rehana Rossouw** reports

I SAAC RANI was tortured for three days by security police after they arrested him in the Sixties for leaving South Africa for military training. On the third day, he was visited by a district surgeon while he lay in his cell vomiting blood. Rani told a Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) hearing the doctor said there was nothing that could be done to help him, he would be dead soon.

Commission investigators, after listening to evidence like this at countless hearings on gross human rights violations, are hard at work uncovering proof of the torture and the names of the police involved. But they will not necessarily attempt to discover why the unnamed doctor did not insist Rani be taken to hospital for treatment, or that his torture be stopped immediately.

There are doctors who are concerned by the mounting evidence that their colleagues were involved in human rights abuses either by omission or commission. They are clamouring for a medical TRC to uncover the past and prevent such violations in the future.

Some of the abuse is already well documented and infamous around the world. The conduct of the two district surgeons who attended to dying activist Steve Biko, led to the Medical Association of South Africa's (Masa) resignation from the World Medical Association.

The Biko affair focused the international spotlight on South Africa's doctors and their ethical stance in an apartheid system. It highlighted the failures of the Medical Association of South Africa and the South African Medical and Dental Council (SAMDC) to censure — or protect — doctors when their ethics were questioned.

One of the Biko doctors, Dr Benjamin Tucker, was a Masa member. When the association refused to cancel his membership or disassociate itself from the SAMDC's findings, several prominent members resigned and formed the National Medical and Dental Association (Namda).

One Masa member did attempt to highlight the dilemmas which the medical profession faced in South Africa. The late Dr Jonathan Gluckman, a Masa office-bearer who worked closely with families of detainees, spoke out about the problems of segregated health care.

Gluckman went up against former minister of law and order Hernus Kriel, whom he accused of conducting a fraudulent investigation into the treatment of detainees. Kriel responded by accusing Gluckman of

"self-glorification".

However, the previous minister of health, Dr Rina Venter, exonerated Gluckman. In an attempt to desegregate hospitals, Venter discovered there were no laws on the statute books which forced them to care for white patients separately from blacks.

It appeared that the medical profession itself had instituted these rules — not only in state hospitals, but in countless private practitioners' surgeries which had separate waiting rooms for white and black patients.

In 1995, Masa finally apologised for its silence on race-based policies affecting the medical profession. Without listing the issues for which it was apologising, the association admitted "persons within and outside the medical profession might, in the past, have been hurt or offended by acts of omission or commission on Masa's part".

The most successful challenge to the medical profession came in 1985 from a young Port Elizabeth district surgeon Dr Wendy Orr. She brought a supreme court interdict against the prison authorities to stop them from assaulting her patients.

The case won her instant infamy in government circles and she was effectively stopped from performing her clinical duties. Today, Orr is a commissioner on the TRC and attends its hearings where victims of police brutality often highlight the failure of doctors to protect them from assaults on the security forces.

Victim after victim has told the TRC how district surgeons treated them in the presence of the security forces, how some gave the go-ahead for further interrogations despite their patients showing obvious signs of mistreatment and how inquest docu-

mentation did not match the wounds relatives had seen in state mortuaries.

In Cape Town this week, the medical profession debated the call for a medical TRC. At a panel discussion organised by the Trauma Centre for Victims of Violence and Torture,

speakers spoke of the need to uncover and document the sins of the past.

Dr Leslie London of the Department of Community Health at the University of Cape Town (UCT), said the case for a medical truth commission was compelling.

"Masa's apology is not underpinned by concrete documentation of what it needed to apologise for. It does not tell us when abuse stopped. An apology does not identify what the failings were in the past and how we are going to prevent it in the future. It is almost like a self-declared amnesty," said London.

He said the medical TRC should be public and send a strong message that the transgression of human rights would not occur again in the South African medical profession. The commission could make recommendations at its conclusion to upgrade ethical education in health sciences and improve reporting mechanisms in places of detention.

Masa's manager of medical ethics Gavin Damster said he believed it was unnecessary to duplicate the functions of the multimillion rand TRC, which it supported.

"We have asked all of our members to go to the TRC if they have been involved in gross human rights viola-

tions. This has been an issue of concern to Masa even before the TRC was up and running," Damster said.

"We are prepared to criticise our members who are not performing and this practice has always been there. Doctors involved have been sent by Masa to the Medical and Dental Council." Damster admitted that many doctors working with the police and prisons believed they had a dual responsibility to the state and their patients. He suggested this dilemma be investigated in a similar manner to the British Medical and Dental Association, which published a report on state doctors called *Medicine Betrayed*.

Dr Mary Rayner of Amnesty International, said the problems highlighted in *Medicine Betrayed* supported the call for a medical TRC. The investigation had shown how ordinary men and women became unwittingly involved in systematic human rights abuses.

"Our experience around the world has shown that there are all sorts of reasons why medical practitioners

working in a prison or army barracks can fall in their duty to their patients," Rayner said.

"They can accept the security force's ideology and motives, they can be affected by the social milieu in which they mix in daily life, they could be concerned about their careers or be subject to direct threats. Over time they can be drawn into a situation of complicity in which the detainee suffers grossly.

It is outside the scope of the TRC to tease out the subtle, institutional ways in which the security forces found support outside their own ranks for what they did.

"In South Africa there are examples of this. There are doctors who participated directly by falsifying medical records. There must be more cases than Steve Biko — people who did not have publicity and expensive advocates at their inquests."

Rayner said the situation was not only of academic interest as abuse was still occurring in South Africa. The "unreformed" police force was still torturing people by electric shock and suffocation.

People entering the medical profession needed information about where the traps lay. They needed to learn the small and passive ways doctors could participate in human rights abuses.

"District surgeons embarking on their careers won't know how to conduct themselves if they don't know what happened in the past," Rayner said.

The Interim South African Medical and Dental Council's registrar, Nic Prinsloo, said his organisation did not discuss the call for a medical TRC and he could thus not comment on it.

He pointed out that the organisation replaced the SAMDC and could not be accountable for what it had done in the past. Although Prinsloo had served on the SAMDC, he was not prepared to discuss how to address its failings.

Dr Judith van Heerden, of UCT's Department of Primary Health Care, sent a direct challenge to Masa and the SAMDC to organise a parallel medical truth commission.

Writing in the June issue of the South African Medical Journal, Van Heerden said South Africa's past was littered with incidents where doctors neglected their caring duty. "Collusion with the state was regarded as patriotic duty by some of them," she said.

"The pain and remorse of this process will be living proof as a commitment to ensure that what happened to Steve Biko should never be allowed to happen in any country that regards itself as civilised," she quoted from a South African Medical Journal editorial of 1991.

Will the health system cope?

The row over extended doctors' training is bringing pressure for other students to do community service.

Philippa Garson and Joshua Amupadhi report

EXTENDING community service for postgraduates of all disciplines, including the medical profession, could help alleviate the funding crisis in tertiary education.

A furious debate developed this week around plans by the Interim National Medical Council to add a compulsory, two-year period of community service to the seven years' training required for qualification as a doctor.

But the controversy has raised questions as to why the concept should be limited to doctors and to teachers — who have long repaid their training loans by state service. What of other professions like law and engineering?

While the state ploughs billions into tertiary education only a fraction is paid back in student fees — and only by some students. Given the crisis around university financing, many are asking whether the time has come for a more effective tertiary financing system that allows students to pay back the money it costs to educate them by doing community service in the public sector.

Wits University dean of Health Sciences Professor Max Price suggests a student-loan system whereby students pay back the bulk of their loans by service — as in the United States.

"The government should give them a loan to pay the entire cost and should then write this off in return for community service. This is not a dictatorial phenomenon. It's done in most industrial countries."

Such a scheme should apply to all professions, not just teachers and doctors. "It would make it clear that taxpayers are making a major investment in individuals' education. The state and society is entitled to a return on that investment," says Price.

Community service has been proposed by the National Commission on Higher Education (NCHE) as one way of paying back the state's contribution towards their studies.

However, the concept has not been developed in any real way and the NCHE, whose final report is due this month, has not thus far come up with solutions to the funding crisis in the tertiary sector.

John Gear, director of the Wits Rural Facility, backs the idea of incentive-driven rather than compulsory community service. "If it is compulsion-driven as opposed to incentive-driven the consequences

are resistance, resentment and inferior services," he says.

But in some fields, the idea of community service still meets with resistance. Wits University engineering Professor Hu Hanrahan said he doubted whether sufficient job opportunities for engineering community service existed in the state. "I don't think community service is as practical in engineering as it is in the health service. It will siphon the engineers out of the market and that will impact on the GDP," he said.

While the notion is popular in some law faculties which point to the need for legal services in rural areas, practical steps at introducing community service have yet to be taken.

But the idea of voluntary service is now taking root on campuses, says Professor Christof Heyns, acting director of Pretoria University's Centre for Human Rights. Heyns helped found the Southern African Student Volunteers three years ago, an organisation based on 22 university and technikon campuses which sends students during holidays to needy areas to help upgrade schools and clinics.

"We get seven times more applications than we can access. It's definitely becoming more popular." But Heyns says black students are far keener on the programmes than their white counterparts who make up only 10% of the volunteer force.

The South African Students' Congress backs the idea of community service, which "augurs well with the spirit of nation-building enshrined in the RDP", says deputy secretary general Kenny Diseko. "We are in support of such a policy because it balances the notion of the brain drain. Some people are selfish. Students should feel obliged to do community service as a contribution to the country."

ANC Youth League general secretary Fèbé Potgieter says her organisation supports the idea of youth service programmes in tertiary institutions.

"There is a need to see that everyone with state assistance must give something back." The National Youth Commission returned recently from a trip to the United States armed with new ideas on implementing community service.

Philippa Garson

WHETHER doctors should get more training and give some service to society at the same time is less in dispute than whether the country — and the students — are ready for it.

The Interim National Medical and Dental Council has been criticised for implementing radical changes to the profession before the legwork has been done and without giving medical students due warning.

Clearly, where 40% of women are giving birth without medical supervision, for example, there is a crying need for more doctors in rural areas. But some health professionals are asking whether these trainee doctors will simply work without supervision as a short-term cure in a collapsing health system.

Questions are also being raised about the council's independence from the government. The council ignored the recommendation of its own "expert team" which proposed one year of extra study, and went with the Health Department's proposal of two years instead.

University of the Witwatersrand dean of Health Sciences Professor Max Price criticised the council for this but said he would keep an "open mind" until it came up with its detailed plan on available facilities and supervision in October.

Council president Professor Soromini Kallichurum said two years' training would be more beneficial if students were given a diploma. "If

the students have misgivings with serious reasons we will relook at it," she said, denying that the council had been pressured by anyone.

Price said the logistics of implementation "need to be carefully worked out", adding, "If the quality of training is not satisfactory I will withdraw my support of the system."

Professor David Sanders, director of the University of the Western Cape's public health programme, said: "Everyone agrees there ought to be some kind of payback and that graduates do some work in the public sector in peri-urban and rural areas where there is greatest need. But we are also surprised at the pace it was introduced, with no preparation in place."

Sanders said there was more a maldistribution of doctors than a shortage, with a concentration of doctors in academic hospitals. "The challenge is to relocate some of these people so the academic complex becomes much broader at regional and district levels."

The Junior Doctors' Association of South Africa has objected to increasing the training period from seven to nine years and called for the curriculum to be shortened instead.

Many students believe that the council's decision to extend doctors' training by two years is a way of introducing "community service" through the back door, to avoid possible battles on the constitutionality of compulsory service.

But the Health Department's Tim Wilson, chief director of academic

complexes, says the department has declined in the past to implement compulsory service and that vocational training will achieve the same objectives, while allowing doctors to gain higher qualifications. The department is looking to fill 1 000 posts in the first year of implementation, 1998, and 300 in the second.

"There is an assumption that everyone will be sent to distant rural areas. But if there is no supervision, we won't send people," Wilson said.

The department hopes, with radically revised salary scales, to pull more doctors into the public service who will supervise the trainee doctors. But all this has yet to happen.

Wilson said the Health Department had not pushed the council into any decisions. "I have great respect for the members of council. They are not likely to be steam-rollered into a decision," he said.

Wilson pointed out that the change will only affect the 30% of medical graduates who don't specialise, and who will have to stay longer in the public service. Those who specialise will probably not be affected. They will have to do an extra year but the council has yet to make proposals on this.

Contrary to the stereotype of white doctors going overseas to escape compulsory service, Price says: "Those who will be affected most are black students who tend to graduate with much higher debt than white students. They tend to go into private practice much sooner than white students."

SANDF chief dodges chemical weapons probe

NOT UNEXPECTEDLY, SA National Defence Force Chief General Georg Meiring has played his cards close to his chest on the country's former chemical weapons programme.

Called to parliament to explain to the Public Accounts Committee why the SANDF had written off R21.8-million (US \$4.07-m) when closing down its secret chemical projects, Meiring disclosed that the closure process was still being carried out. He refused to elaborate, saying it was "a particularly difficult and intricate exercise" because of the sensitivities involved.

The chemical weapons programme was, according to the former government, terminated in 1993, after South Africa signed the international conventions banning the use of such weapons.

The Office for Serious Economic Offences (OSEO) is investigating the privatisation of at least two of the companies involved in the projects in the 1990s - Delta G Research and Roodeplaat Research Laboratories (RRL).

The assets of both companies, which had been bought by the government with secret funds to start the chemical weapons programme, were transferred to the directors in what Meiring said was a move authorised by the former Defence and Finance Ministers in the previous National Party government.

At the time of the privatisation, General Magnus Malan had the Defence portfolio

and Barend du Plessis was Finance Minister.

Newspaper reports showed that the directors of RRL walked away with R17.9-m (\$4.2-m) between them after the company was liquidated in 1994 and 1995. The original share capital of the privatised firm was a mere R50,000 (\$11,600). A large chunk of the assets of RRL consisted of investments from a "non-distributable reserve" of more than R30-m (\$7-m), which came originally from a "cancellation payment" after certain "research and production agreements" were stopped.

The large amounts of the money involved in just the RRL operation raises suspicions about whether the chemical weapons programme was indeed defensive in nature, as was claimed by the military's Surgeon-General Lieutenant-General Niel Knobel, whose Medical Services Corps oversaw the projects.

Knobel and the government claimed the project never saw weapons being produced for offensive purposes but concentrated on providing systems and equipment which would enable SA soldiers in the field - and primarily in the Angolan war situation - to escape the worst effects of chemical and biological attacks.

Meiring has yet to explain the loss of US \$1.6-m (R6.9-m) in late 1993, in a deal to buy chemicals. The deal went horribly wrong, with one of the South Africans involved being arrested in Zurich, Switzerland. He was Wouter Basson, a former medical doctor attached to Knobel's Seven Medical Battalion. Basson, who rose eventually to the rank of brigadier, had Special Forces training and connections, as did a number of others involved in the covert chemical programmes.

Significantly, Basson was part of a delegation from transport parastatal Transnet which went to Libya in 1994 to discuss business possibilities. His presence in the delegation - which was there to talk about possible railway projects - greatly alarmed the United States and British governments.

Libya has been repeatedly accused of embarking on a massive programme to make chemical weapons.

OSEO is also investigating the payment of US \$1.6-m (R6.9-m) into a bank account in Croatia, according to its chief investigator, Jan Swanepoel. Meiring told the accounts committee he believed the payment would have been authorised by the SA Reserve Bank but that he was not privy to what it was used for.

Allegations of amounts paid from RRL to a chemical company in Switzerland have been levelled by one of RRL's former employees, who received nothing in the liquidation and has challenged the whole liquidation proceeding.

The man, Dr Schalk Van Rensburg, claimed in papers sent to the Master of the Supreme Court that he did not believe any money had changed hands when the company was privatised and that he believed there was widespread misuse of state funds in the day-to-day running of RRL.

Van Rensburg claimed the company was set up in 1984 as a front for the state and that "sham" shares were issued to him and a number of other directors. He said the first directors were required to sign an undertaking surrendering their rights to the state.

Mandela was target of chemical weapons 'war'

THE CONTINUING SAGA of South Africa's apartheid chemical weapons programme threatens to haunt the National Party even as it moves to set itself up as the principled opposition to the ANC.

Latest press disclosures have confirmed previously held suspicions by the ANC and international intelligence networks that South Africa used aspects of its chemical and biological weapons programmes to develop poisons to kill or disable its opponents.

President Nelson Mandela was, according to those who worked within the programme, one of the prime targets of the poison development teams. It was hoped he could either be poisoned or that a carcinogenic chemical introduced into his food would eventually give him cancer.

This crude type of planning was common to the security forces in the heyday of the "total onslaught" years, but it appears that sanity returned in the late 1980s, when it became obvious to all that Mandela would play a major role in the future of the country. Indeed, physicians who attended him when he was imprisoned on Robben Island, later at Pollsmoor prison outside Cape Town and then Victor Verster prison near Paarl, have said the authorities were careful almost to the point of paranoia about drugs which were administered to him.

While Mandela himself may have been taken off the target list, the poisoners continued to focus on other prominent anti-apartheid activists.

He said he understood that, following the "Information Scandal", when millions of rands of government slush funds were misappropriated on newspaper and information projects, former Prime Minister and later State President Pieter W Botha arranged for a senior partner in an accounting and auditing firm to oversee a number of covert projects to ensure that state funds were not diverted or stolen.

RRL company records show that its senior staff and researchers, who were working on the chemical weapons programme for the SADF, attended local and international medical and other conferences. In one case, an official paid a visit to the United States Food and Drug Administration to investigate what would be required to become a registered laboratory.

Personnel members were also involved in medical research and other scientific bodies in SA are also suspected of deep involvement in chemical weapons programmes.

Foremost among these was former SA Council of Churches Secretary-General Reverend Frank Chikane, who fell ill during a trip to the United States in 1989.

American Central Intelligence Agency sources have linked the illness to the use of organo-phosphate salts, which were allegedly impregnated in Rev Chikane's clothes when he transited through Windhoek airport in Namibia on his way to the U.S.

Chikane's case was re-opened late last year by the SA police and he was asked to make another statement, indicating that the new government intends to try and clear up some of the mysterious deaths and illnesses of anti-apartheid activists.

Another death which has been attributed to poisoning was that of ANC cadre and Umkhonto we Sizwe commander Thami Zulu, who fell ill and died in Lusaka. US

intelligence sources subsequently said they believed Zulu was poisoned by a SA agent who had infiltrated ANC ranks in exile.

The latest reports give the lie to repeated claims by SA National Defence Force Chief General Georg Meiring, and the head of the SA Medical Services, Lieutenant-General Niel Knobel, that the chemical weapons programmes were solely defensive in nature and in response to the belief that Angolan and Cuban forces possessed chemical and biological agents during the bitter bush war battles in Angola.

An unresolved incident in the late 1980s, when a number of Mozambican soldiers fell mysteriously ill after a "black cloud" drifted over their camp from the SA border, could well be re-investigated. If it is proved chemical agents from SA were responsible, the Pretoria authorities could well have the moral obligation to pay compensation to those afflicted.

General Meiring could also face tough grilling on the details of the programmes, which were known variously as "Project B", "Jota" and "Project Coast", when he returns to Cape Town to again face the parliamentary committee on public accounts. The committee has been investigating the spending of millions of rands in chemical deals in 1993 and other expenditure, including the supposed destruction of chemical stockpiles valued at R21 million.

The Office for Serious Economic Offences in Pretoria is probing the supposed "privatisation" of defence force front companies in the early 1990s, which enabled the directors of those companies to walk away with millions when the concerns were either sold or liquidated (Vol 14 No 20).

'Terror' Lekota fights a losing battle

Signs are that Free State Premier Patrick 'Terror' Lekota will be deposed, write **M&G** reporters

FREE STATE Premier Patrick 'Terror' Lekota is losing the fight for his political life, having been abandoned by the African National Congress leadership in his battle with party rivals in the province.

As pressure mounts to oust him from his position, there were indications this week that the ANC leadership were not backing him in his fight against alleged corruption in the province — leaving him to the fate of bitter enemies who have taken control of the provincial party machinery.

Lekota said this week he had decided not to speak to the media, but his political allies confirmed that he is extremely worried about his future.

The premier is embroiled in a row with the ANC in his province following his suspension of senior government officials on allegations of fraud. Lekota was not re-elected to the ANC's provincial working committee last weekend after it met in his absence.

The ANC's national working committee is to hear a report from a delegation sent to the province by its national executive committee meeting. Sports Minister Steve Tshwete, ANC chief whip Arnold Stofile and security boss Joe Nhlanhla recently visited the province to discuss the tensions between Lekota and provincial ANC members.

ANC spokesman Ronnie

Mamoepa said recommendations from those discussions have been referred to the national working committee. He said the political situation in the ANC Free State is receiving the ongoing attention of ANC structures with a view to finding an "amicable" solution.

In terms of the Constitution, a premier can only be removed from office by a vote of no confidence in his legislature. But Lekota's former comrades from the United Democratic Front (UDF), which he served as publicity secretary in the 1980s, are concerned that their generation does not enjoy much support in the ANC's national structures.

The Free State legislature is to hear a report this month from its provincial standing committee on trade and industry whether Lekota's suspensions of the officials were accord-

ing to procedure. The matter will be put to the vote in the legislature.

Some of Lekota's former UDF comrades are not only worried about his future, but are themselves trying to keep their heads down to avoid any kind of media attention or controversy.

There is a feeling in some UDF circles that Lekota's troubles are part of a wider political upheaval centering on provincial leaders who are involved in trying to root out corruption.

Lekota spent six years on Robben Island for his role in organising pro-Frelimo rallies in 1974. He was also a former Delmas treason trialist, and was one of the most charismatic internal leaders whose integrity and honesty were regarded as pivotal to the UDF's political successes.

He was first elected to the ANC's national executive in 1991.

Endangered species: Free State Premier Patrick 'Terror' Lekota has fallen out with those in provincial and national ANC structures



DEMOCRACY:

Indicators from Ju'hoan Bushmen in Namibia

by Barbara Wyckoff-Baird

Namibia, formally called Southwest Africa, was once a colony of both Germany and Britain and then part of South Africa until 1990. With Independence, the incoming majority-rule government faced a stiff challenge of establishing new democratic relations of power from the complex colonial legacy of racial and ethnic stratification. The Ju'hoansi (!Kung, Ju/Wasi) Bushmen are a population of Khoisan-speaking former hunter-gathers residing in northeastern Namibia and the northwestern Kalahari Desert region of Botswana.

Traditionally, the Ju'hoansi were organized as bands of individuals supported by the resources of a *n!ore*, the Ju'hoansi word meaning, "the place to which you belong." In 1970, Bushmanland was established by the Government of South Africa as the homeland for the Ju'hoan and other Bushmen. For the Ju'hoansi, "it meant the loss of 90% of their traditional land of Nyae Nyae, and all but one of their permanent waterholes," according to Megan Biesele. As part of this process, many Ju'hoansi moved to the administrative center of Tjum!kui where the Government of South Africa provided a school, a clinic, a few jobs and a liquor store. By the late 1970s, Tjum!kui had become a rural slum and was referred to by the Ju'hoansi as "the place of death."

During the 1980s, the Nyae Nyae Development Foundation of Namibia (NNDFN) was formed to aid Ju'hoan efforts at self-reliance. It supported a "back to the land movement" by which the Ju'hoansi would leave Tjum!kui to return to their *n!oresi* (villages). Today, there are some 37 decentralized communities in Nyae Nyae, each with a water source, usually a borehole with a windmill, *kraals* (corrals) for protecting their cattle and small agricultural fields and gardens. The communities range in size

from about a dozen people to as many as 150. In collaboration with the NNDFN, the Nyae Nyae Farmers Cooperative (NNFC) implements activities ranging from a village school program to health promotion, from running a shop to natural resource management.

The Ju'hoansi face both the challenge and the opportunity of engaging in the new political process. Central to this challenge is how indigenous social organization can adapt itself to the recently independent nation of Namibia and, in the long-term, the wider global society.

Traditionally, the Ju'hoansi were organized as bands of individuals supported by the resources of a n!ore, the Ju'hoansi word meaning, "the place to which you belong."

The Ju'hoan culture of equality and tolerance has always underplayed individual, elected leadership in favor of participation of all sectors of the population in consensus decision-making. Yet the Ju'hoansi are now faced with the necessity of selecting leaders, forming new structures and participating in a representative system if they are going to participate in the new politics and compete with other segments of Namibian society for a share of national resources. The most immediate example is a recent government policy which aims to return to indigenous people the rights of management and benefit from tourism and wildlife. Part of this policy requires the Ju'hoansi to form a Conservancy Committee that will be the executive

body over the wildlife and tourism resources. As stated in the policy, the committee should, "consist of elected or appointed representatives of the community. The MET [Ministry of Environment and Tourism] must be satisfied that the members of the conservancy council are sufficiently representative of the community served by the conservancy." This also raises the question of who is best suited to judge the representation of the Conservancy Committee that is required by the government in order to grant to indigenous people the rights to benefit from tourism and wildlife.

Evolution of the Nyae Nyae Farmers Cooperative (NNFC)

The Ju/Wa Farmers Union, renamed the Nyae Nyae Farmers Cooperative (NNFC) in 1990, was first constituted in 1986. The individuals in the Ju/Wa Farmers Union did not speak for others in the community; rather, they facilitated communication and decision-making by providing information within the community, maintaining "official" contacts with outsiders (e.g. government representatives; technicians; donors) and communicating the opinions and ideas of the local residents. The traditional egalitarianism and tolerance inherent in the Ju'hoan system mitigated against individuals accruing power or authority.

In 1988-89, it became necessary to formalize the organizational structure and leadership system of the Ju/Wa Farmers Union as the number of *n!oresi* was rapidly increasing. There was also a need to facilitate an application for legal recognition in the soon to be independent Namibia. The Union drafted a set of statutes establishing a representative organization. (See Figure 1: Evolution of decision-making structures in Nyae

Nyae, for a schematic representation of this and other structures of the NNFC.) The basis of this structure was the Representative Council. It was decided that each of the *n!oresi* would choose and be represented by two individuals, one male and one female. The members of the Representative Council, in turn, elected a Chairperson, a Secretary and one representative from each quarter of Nyae Nyae (at the time there were three) to form the five-person Management Committee. The Committee became responsible for the day-to-day management of the development program and services provided to and on behalf of the community, funded largely by international donors.

Megan Biesele characterizes the new representative structures as coming not from the people themselves, but as imported models and expectations. Taken a step further, the early approach focused on the products of democratization (i.e., creating representative institutions) rather than on the process of democratization (i.e., indigenous people defining and achieving their own appropriate models). This is not to say that international models of democracy and representative institutions as the products of that democracy are necessarily bad. Rather, when such structures are imposed on indigenous people, the very process of democratization is ignored and local people are denied the opportunity to develop their models for adapting traditional ways to a modern world.

Early 1995: Institutional Dilemmas in Nyae Nyae

While the NNFC constitution and other documentation describes the externally-based leadership structures and communication roles, the reality on the ground has continued to evolve. Between 1991 and 1995, the Management Committee became an isolated decision-making body, often speaking on behalf of the community, making decisions for them and rarely communicating the results back to the community. Ideas and inputs from the community for planning

and implementation of the development program were rarely sought. Visits by the Management Committee members to the *n!oresi* had become all but non-existent by early 1995. Interviews in January 1995 revealed that most community members were not aware of the Management Committee's current activities. Community members expressed dissatisfaction with the Management Committee, frequently stating that the members should be replaced.

Interviews also revealed that, while a representative structure might be in place, the changes in culture and social organization necessary to make the structure effective had not occurred. Community members who were interviewed continued to believe that no one could speak on their behalf. Several respondents during interviews in January 1995 said that they had not "chosen" their representative to the Council and that they had no sense of one person having been selected to perform a representative role on the Council. Several *n!oresi* reported that a different individual attended almost every meeting.

Furthermore, the roles and responsibilities of the various parties in a representative structure were not clearly understood. Community members did not see themselves as having rights to demand information and accountability from their representatives. In discussions with ten members of the Representative Council, all agreed that they were not sure how to perform their roles and that they required training in representative governance.

A number of factors have been instrumental in the council's evolution. Rapid growth in population size (due to the return to the area of Ju'hoan Bushmen from administrative centers and farms) and expansion of the scope of the activities of the NNFC have created enormous challenges for effective communication and participatory decision-making. Reaching the entire Ju'hoan population of about 2,000 regarding a whole host of decisions had become an impossible task for the Management Committee (now four

members with limited transportation). In addition, given difficult logistics and the high cost of holding meetings, the Representative Council had generally met annually, rather than every six months as previously intended. The result was that the Management Committee began making decisions on behalf of the community. Outsiders, including government representatives, donors and other individuals began to view the Management Committee as representative of the NNFC. Given the difficulty of getting the Representative Council together on short notice, decisions were sought from the Management Committee on behalf of the community. Finally, there was a lack of a formal or consistent effort to educate people regarding their roles and responsibilities in this new system.

By early 1995, the NNFC seemed to have evolved from a participatory organization, built upon a tradition of decision-making by consensus, to one centralized at the Management Committee level with little or no participation by community members. It is certain that the imposition of a representative structure as a symbol of democracy contributed to this evolution by concentrating authority in a few select individuals, a concept disliked by the Ju'/hoansi. Given that this structure was not of their own making, the Ju'/hoansi did not have the insights or resources necessary to modify and adjust the model to the expanded scope in NNFC activities and population growth.

Recent Developments and Options for the Future

It is against this backdrop that a group, which included the Management Committee, ten members of the Representative Council and eleven other community members, agreed that the current structure and operation of the Management Committee was inhibiting effective communication with all sections of the community. This group also recognized that changes in their social environment, the need to have some collective voice in order to participate in the new

nation state, and the realities of receiving donor funds necessitated a revised structure that would allow decisions to be made in a timely fashion and with consensus, thereby maintaining some legitimacy in the eyes of the community.

In response, members of the Representative Council elected two Representatives from each of the four districts to join the Management Committee and form the Management Board, bringing the total to 12 members. The primary role of the Management Board is two-way communication at two levels: 1) between community members and the Management Committee as the NNFC implements the rural development program; and 2) between community members and outsiders (i.e., government representatives, donors and non-governmental organizations).

This board meets monthly, and then holds meetings bi-monthly in the board members' respective districts. The objectives of the meetings are to promote joint decision-making, problem-solving, and long and short-term planning; to increase community participation in managing and evaluating NNFC progress; and to provide a forum for intra-community information sharing and announcing achievements.

To improve communication and facilitate community participation in decision-making, the NNFC has also taken on a Community Ranger Program. The program was started in mid-1994 by an Australian, Neil Powell, and the original roles of the community rangers were to gather data on and monitor land and wildlife resources, and then communicate this information to the *n!oresi* owners. The Community Rangers are appointed at district level meetings and are managed by the village leaders. Already, there has been constructive criticism of the rangers who have responded by expressing a sense of accountability to the residents of the *n!oresi*.

The Management Committee and Representative Council also have acknowledged that the scope of the community rangers' role is broader than natural resources. Their reports now include information on all of the development issues facing the community. Although

the rangers have a critical communication role, they do not have a decision-making or representative function.

The January 1995 interviews showed that, in contrast to community members' lack of knowledge of the activities of the Management Committee, over 80 percent stated they knew about the local community ranger's identity, role and responsibilities. (It is important to note that it was the Ju'/hoansi themselves who modified the responsibilities of the rangers to include broader development issues and to reinforce the centrality of their communication role.)

To address the issue of outsiders who make random visits to the NNFC and do not allow time to visit the *n!oresi* to hear the opinions of community members, the Management Board has established the first week of every month as a time when all members will be available at the NNFC office. In this way, donors, government representatives and other individuals can easily meet with a broader representation of the community.

In July 1995, a series of workshops was initiated to enable the Management Board and Community Rangers to clarify their roles. The results of these meetings have been discussed with community residents at district-level workshops in order to educate and inform community members regarding governance issues and to seek their concurrence with the proposed roles. Further training and clarification of governance roles and responsibilities are required for the Representative Council and the community at large.

Problems of the lack of involvement of community members in program implementation, poor communication and centralized decision-making may still persist in the new

Management Board structure. It could potentially be beneficial to explore a more "bottom-up" approach and expand the district organizational concept to include "village associations."

Conclusions

What is so important about this new phase in the evolution of the Ju'/hoan socio-political organization is that now the Ju'/hoansi are themselves developing appropriate models through their own initiatives. They are building a structure that reflects their needs and perceptions and which also incorporates their traditional ways by allowing for consensus-building.

Further, it permits the Ju'/hoansi to speak with a collective voice. Just as external conditions will not remain static, neither will the structures that are developed. However, given that these models have been developed and chosen by the Ju'/hoansi themselves, it is more likely that they will have the insights and resources necessary to adapt their structures to changing situations.

There are certainly other governance issues, including problems of social equity in access to program resources, growing divisions between older and younger generations, as well as between women and men, and integration within the national society. But these must be addressed by the Ju'/hoansi themselves. As Megan Bieseke writes, allowing traditional ideas and models to persist, or to be changed organically by the people's own initiatives, is a "pretty good indicator of democracy at work." ■

Acknowledgments

This work is supported with funding from USAID and WWF, and is a collaborative effort with Namibian government and non-governmental organizations. James Baird has provided invaluable insights, unwavering love and support.

References

- Bieseke, Megan. 1990. *Shaken Roots: The Bushmen of Namibia*. Marshaltown, South Africa: EDA Publications.
- . 1994. Human Rights and Democratization in Namibia: Some Grassroots Political Perspectives. Paper prepared for the Annual Meeting of the African Studies Association, Ontario.
- . Unpublished. Eating Crow in the Kalahari: Leveling Lessons Taught by the Ju'/hoan Bushmen to their NGO. Houston Texas: Rice University.
- Hitchcock, Robert. 1992. Communities and Consensus: An Evaluation of the Activities of the Nyae Nyae Development Foundation in Northeastern Namibia. Report to the Ford Foundation and the Nyae Nyae Development Foundation (NNDEN). Windhoek, Namibia and New York, N.Y.
- Powell, Neil S. 1995. Participatory Land Use Planning: Methods Development Incorporating the Needs and Aspirations of Indigenous Peoples in Natural Resource Management; a Case from Eastern Bushmanland, Namibia. Report to the Directorate of Environmental Affairs, Ministry of Environment and Tourism (MET), Government of Namibia, Windhoek.

Barbara Wyckoff-Baird is an anthropologist and Technical Advisor to Community-Based Natural Resource Management programs in Namibia. She has worked for World Wildlife Fund (WWF) since 1989, providing support to indigenous communities to gain control over and sustainably manage their natural resources.



REGION:

SA defence minister calls for arms build-up in region

South Africa's Defence Minister Joe Modise has publicly snubbed Namibia and given his support to Botswana's rapid arms build-up. He has also repeated his call for other countries in the region to build up their armies, warning that SA alone cannot bear the burden of defending a region rich in mineral wealth.

The advice flies in the face not just of local politicians and analysts who say the region faces no external threat, and is not likely to, but goes against the strictures of the World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF) who are laying down the economic rules for most of the region and who want military spending sharply cut.

Modise, as chairman of Southern African Development Community (SADC) Inter-State Defence and Security Committee gave his backing in Windhoek to Botswana's arms drive. The decision to buy second hand Leopard tanks and F-5 fighter bombers from Canada has been harshly attacked in neighbouring Namibia as the beginnings of a regional arms drive (*SouthScan* v11/27 p215; v11/24 p191).

Modise's encouragement of a military build-up, and South Africa's welcoming of the massive arms purchases by Botswana, came after talks behind closed doors with his Namibian counterpart Phillemon Malima.

Namibian Prime Minister Hage Geingob had earlier denounced the arms purchases, saying that Africa should not spend its money on an arms race while its people go hungry. Geingob made the remark during the visit of the German deputy speaker, Burkhard Hirsch, and a senior German parliamentary delegation, who announced that Germany would prevent the Netherlands from selling the German-made Leopard tanks to Botswana.

Modise's remarks immediately elicited sharp rebukes in Windhoek, and Namibia's opposition party, the Democratic Turnhalle Alliance (DTA), appealed to the international community to dissuade South Africa from its "insane ideas". The DTA said that Modise's appeal seriously threatened democracy in the Southern African region.

Modise said the strengthening of military capabilities by individual SADC members ought to be welcomed because the region, rich in mineral wealth, can never be assured of lasting peace. He said that the defence capabilities of the region should not rest only on South Africa's shoulders.

South Africa did not view Botswana's intended purchases as a threat, he said.

"No, on the contrary. I encourage it. If it does not happen, if our region is attacked, we are expected to take joint action."

He, however, could not give any indication about the nature or source of any military threat to Botswana, South Africa or Southern Africa as a whole.

"No one can predict where the threat lies. Any country that attacks us will not notify us prior to the attack. What we are doing in our country is keeping a reserve force, which enables us to defend ourselves if we are attacked, and we are also building up military capabilities if the need exists. I think it will be a mistake to say that this country or that country is

planning to attack us," says Modise.

"In other words, there is no visible threat, but we must be prepared, because if we are not prepared, we will not get a second chance. We will be totally destroyed and colonised again."

After it was pointed out to Modise that there was concern among his own generals about the military build-up in Botswana, he described such concern as groundless.

"If there are generals who are concerned, then they are misguided. Those generals still do not understand the purpose of the Interstate Defence and Security Committee. The purpose of that body is to defend the region. I think that those generals ought to be pleased that Botswana, Zambia, and I hope Namibia and all the others (countries) should equip themselves in such a manner that we can jointly defend ourselves. This is one region with massive mineral wealth that should be protected," Modise said.

Tanks decision

The Botswana Defence Force, meanwhile, has said it has not been officially informed that the German government would not agree to the Netherlands exporting 50 German-made Leopard tanks to Botswana.

When the proposed deal was first reported, Botswana Defence Force commander Lt-Gen. Ian Khama said if Botswana did not get the tanks from the Dutch, it would get them from elsewhere.

Khama last week said he had bought from Nato before. "The block is initiated by other countries who have pleaded with Germany to assist them," he said.

Namibia has been particularly critical of the deal and another in which Botswana bought 13 F-5 fighter-bombers from Canada.

During the last three months, Namibia has on three occasions accused Botswana of a military build-up over the ownership of an island in the Chobe river and moving troops to control the movement of diseased cattle across the Namibia-Botswana border.

"Namibia would be better off raising any objections in the regional Joint Commission on Defence and Security, of which it is a member," Khama said.

Khama said the arms purchases were part of a plan to build up the BDF. Formed in 1977 from scratch, the army had no colonial inheritance of men, nor of equipment.

"Eleven years after our independence, we did not have the advantage of other countries in the region who, when they became independent, took over long-standing armies," he said.

SA's military role

The future role of SA's own military and defence industry is still being hotly debated within the country, and Modise's statement is bound to raise future arms spending issues again. In March Modise announced a "huge programme of replacement" for the country's armed forces over the next ten years (*SouthScan* v11/13).

However, he faces opposition from inside the parliamentary defence committee, where intended purchases have been challenged as a diversion of much needed funds away from reconstruction and development.

Arms sales are now being monitored by another committee under the chairmanship of Water Affairs Minister Kader Asmal. But privately military analysts complain that the arms sales industry is still insufficiently checked.

The Church has weighed in to the debate and last week Anglican church representative Terry Crawford-Browne, an adviser to Archbishop Desmond Tutu, called for the dismantling of the local arms exporting industry.

Jane's Defence Weekly correspondent Helmut Romer-Heitman reported that within 20 years the balance of power looked set to alter radically with nations such as India, Brazil, Argentina, China, Japan, Indonesia and a unified Korea emerging as regional or even superpowers "ready like schoolchildren in a schoolyard to search for playgrounds."

South Africa needed to act as a deterrent by retaining its ability to police its waters as well as those of states as far north as Kenya and Angola.

He said submarines were also essential to prevent illegal foreign fishing.

Thugwane strikes gold

SA comes of age with five medals

BY GARY LEWIS

ATLANTA

South Africa's reputation as a nation of marathoners was restored on Sunday in sensational fashion when Josiah Thugwane destroyed the best field in Olympic history to lift the gold medal.

They call Thugwane, the 25-year-old Bethal mine employee, TLS - Tough Little S... - and on Sunday the 1.58m, 45kg runner showed exactly why.

He toyed with a field that included world champion Martin Fiz, Dionicio Ceron, the most dominant marathoner over the past few years, Australian Steve Monaghan and Mexican German Silver. His time of 2hr 12min 36sec is quicker than the 1992 winning effort of 2:13:23, but some way off the Olympic best of 2:09:21 set by Carlos Lopez in 1984.

Thugwane was always in contention on a course which is a real tester. Though conditions were slightly cooler than expected, the race was a tactical one. And no one did a better job than the SA champion. "I always fancied my chances while we were running up front. I could see that the Kenyan (third-placed Eric Wainaina) was struggling when I started to do fartleks on the 37km mark. But the Korean (silver medalist Bong-Ju Lee) was tough. He gave me a really hard time, but he wasn't able to go with me when I surged for the last time with the stadium in sight," he said. In reality, the South African trio of Thugwane, Lawrence Peu and Cert Thys tore this field apart. They surged to the front from halfway, which they went through in a relatively slow 1:07:36 and only fell off the bus of nearly 50 runners at around the 34km mark.

Both Peu, 27th in 2:18:09 and Thys, 33rd in 2:18:55 in a field of

111 finishers, paid tribute to their teammate. "He's a real toughie," said Thys. "When we were in the pack with Ceron and Fiz (the two pre-race favourites) I could see they weren't responding to Thugwane's surges. I knew from the 30km mark that he would win."

Thugwane, who finished full of running, raising hands, doing a victory jig and gesturing just before the line for someone to hand him a South African flag, was consistent throughout the race. His 5km splits read 15:35 (5-10km), 15:48 (20-25km), 15:30 (25-30km), 15:11 (30-35km) and 15:33 (35-40km).

"I didn't give myself a chance before the race, but once we were into it I felt good. I'm just so very happy. There have been a lot of sacrifices, but it's all been worth it. I must thank Xolile Yawa for teaching me how to fartlek. That was the difference today between winning and losing."

Thugwane made his bolt for glory with the Olympic Stadium in sight. He managed to break Lee and Wainaina inside the last kilometre, but even though he arrived first on the track with little under 500m left, victory wasn't in the bag... yet.

With all three medalists on the track at the same time, he maintained his lead, winning by three seconds in the tightest result in Olympic marathon history. Though the victory was worth R150 000 as an incentive from the Department of Sport, he's now going to be in the big league as far as appearance fees go.

Sapa reports that Thugwane dedicated his victory to long-time friend Yawa, who pulled out a week ago with a stress fracture.

"I ran this race for my country and my president, but especially for Xolile, who has always been an inspiration to me. His injury was a blow to the team," he said.



STREETFIGHTERS: The chasing pack has dropped out far behind as these three men battle it out stride for stride on Sunday. The thrilling race went right down to the wire with South Africa's Josiah Thugwane (right) winning by three seconds from Lee Bong-Ju of Korea (centre) and Eric Wainaina of Kenya. Thugwane clocked 2 hours 12 minutes 35 seconds to snatch gold.

BY SEAN BADENHORST

Atlanta - Josiah Thugwane's victory in the men's marathon on Sunday capped a successful Olympic Games visit for South Africa, with the team taking three gold, one silver and one bronze medal home today.

The hardware haul was well up on the 1992 tally when the team brought back two silver medals from Barcelona.

Star swimmer Penny Heyns got the medal magnet rolling when she set a new world record in the heats of the women's 100m breaststroke and then won the gold medal in the final on the second day of competition.

She then followed that up with gold in the 200m breaststroke two days later, showing more emotion than after her 100m victory and confirming her status as the top women's breaststroker in the world.

Inspired by Heyns' efforts, teammate Marianne Kriel surprised even herself in winning the bronze medal in the women's 100m backstroke, while Brendon Dedekind and Ryk Neethling signalled they are good medal prospects for Sydney in 2000 when they finished fifth in the men's 50m freestyle and 1 500m freestyle respectively.

After a number of disappointments from the athletics team early in the second week, Hezekiel Sepeng unleashed his incredible speed to come from behind and collect the silver medal in the 800m last Wednesday, before Thugwane beat the strongest men's marathon field ever assembled on Sunday to round off the Games on a high note.

And now for the Paralympics

BY STUART KELLY

The Olympic Games may be over but South Africans will have more sporting excitement to look forward to in Atlanta as the national paralympic squad left this week for their version of the Olympics.

Far from the maddening crowds which have come to symbolise the Atlanta event, another, lesser known but perhaps greater breed of heroes look likely to bring home far more medals than the South African Olympic team ever dreamed of.

While South African Airways' "Ndizani" brought the Olympic athletes home from Atlanta, a team of 41 athletes comprising eight swimmers, 12 bowlers, 18 track and field athletes, two shotists and an archer were on their way to the Paralympic Games which begin this Sunday.

Included in the team are several sportsmen and women who have world titles to defend - as many as nine members of the SA squad are world record holders. Farie Lombaard, disabled in a rugby game, went on to represent South Africa in the shot, discus and javelin events, in which he now boasts tremendous success. For him, the Atlanta Paralympics could prove the crowning glory.

"I wouldn't bet against his coming back with three world records and three gold medals," said Andy Scott, spokesman for the SA Paralympics squad.

Another in his class is Michael Louwrens. He smashed the discus world record in his class in a South African team which won eight silver and eight bronze medals at the world athletics championships in Berlin two years ago.

Among the greatest hopes is

swimmer and world record holder Tadhg Slattery. He is deaf and suffers from cerebral palsy, but that doesn't seem to stop him from competing with able-bodied swimmers. For the squad, the battle began even before selections. Having to deal with people such as a former South African television executive who described disabled sport as "unsightly", the battle for credibility was even taken up with NOCSA when it appeared as if Sam Ramsamy had overlooked an invitation to send a disabled squad to the demonstration events at the Commonwealth Games in Victoria.

"We're disabled, discarded and disgusted," Scott said in an interview. Their angry stand certainly worked. Nocs quickly extended a helping hand when the National Paralympic Committee began the task of looking for money to send a team to Atlanta. Even big business is taking them seriously. Mercedes SA has sponsored the team to the tune of R500 000.

Although lagging behind other countries in our attitude towards disabled sport, where just about every meeting extends an invitation to an elite disabled team, there is every reason to believe that things may change. Especially as SA's Paralympic squad's medals tally will be difficult to ignore. The committee even has a distinctive logo - a butterfly. "It is symbolic," said committee president Peter Goldhawk.